

Preventive Officers and Preventive Men.

COUNTER-STATEMENTS TO, AND AWARDS ON, CLAIMS
BEFORE THE CIVIL SERVICE ARBITRATION BOARD.

Number of Claim.	Service Association.	Subject.	Date of Counter-Statement.	Date of Award.	General Order.	Page.
I.	Waterguard Federation	Wages and allowances.	21 Jan., 1919	6 Mar., 1919	32/1919	1-14

I. WAGES AND ALLOWANCES.

Counter-Statement, dated 21st January, 1919.

78173/1918 & 9911/1919.

SUMMARY OF COUNTER-STATEMENT.

1. Interests affected.
2. History.
3. Work.
4. " continued.
5. " night and Sunday.
6. " special War.
7. Type of man required.
8. Salaries and Stars.
9. Peacetime emoluments—Overtime pay.
10. " " —Night-time allowance.
11. " " —Sunday pay.
12. " " —Uniform.
13. " " —Summary.
14. Wartime emoluments—War work.
15. " " —War bonus.
16. " " —Summary.
17. Windfalls—Aliens' work.
18. " —Seizure rewards.
19. " —Acting work.
20. Novel claims—London allowance.
21. " —Former " in charge " posts.
22. " " " On call " posts.
23. Present claims as to overtime and Sunday pay.
24. Review of existing scheme.
25. Proposed improvements—Salaries.
26. " " —Preventive men's overtime pay.
27. " " —Sunday pay.
28. " " —Summary.
29. Effect on War work allowances.
30. Conclusion.

APPENDICES.

- A. Increase in salaries and promotion.
- B. Entrants' qualifications, notice of.
- C. Salary scales.
- D. Average yearly emoluments.
- E. Ordinary and overtime rates.

1. *Interests affected.*—The Waterguard Federation represents two separate existing Associations, viz:—

- (a) The Preventive Men's Association, representing the lowest rank of the Customs and Excise Preventive Service, engaged on purely rank and file work in the different ports, under the supervision of Preventive Officers:
- (b) The Preventive Officers' Association, representing the next rank above the Preventive Men, engaged partly in supervising the rank below and partly on superior rank and file work. Their position is much the same as that of Petty Officers and Chief Petty Officers in the Royal Navy.

These two Associations cover about 1,600 men, the lower ranks of the Preventive service, which forms one of the two branches into which the Waterguard Service is divided. The other branch, viz., the Launch Service, covering about 175 men, has presented its case separately.

2. *History.*—On the final adoption of Free Trade in 1860 the Waterguard branch of the Customs Department was absorbed into the Landing branch. Speaking broadly, the Preventive Man work was done by a special class of "Boatmen" on scales rising to £75 a year (about 29s. a week), and the Preventive Officer work was done originally by the Customs "Examining Officers," who corresponded to the present Officers of Customs and Excise, and, after 1885, by a new junior class called "Assistant Examining Officers" (£100—£3—£150). There was hardly any promotion for the Boatmen; on an average only 1 per annum was promoted to the Examining Officer Class during the 11 years ending with 1891. and only 7 per annum to the Assistant Examining Officer Class during the 6 years 1886—1891. In 1891 the Waterguard Branch was reconstructed as a separate Department, and manned as follows:—

- 1,126 Boatmen, £55—£1—£80.
- 310 Preventive Officers, £90—£5—£150.
- 20 Superior posts.

Since then the salaries and other emoluments, and the prospects of promotion, have progressively improved (*see Appendix A*). In 1905 the title "Preventive Man" was substituted for "Boatman"; in 1912 the Department was re-organised by an Inter-departmental Committee, whose report was published as Parliamentary Paper Cd. 6290, with the Minutes of Evidence in Cd. 6299, and it is now constituted as follows (omitting the Launch Crews):—

- 1 Inspector-General, £850—£25—£1,000.
- 3 Inspectors and Superintendents, 1st Class, £600—£20—£650.
- 9 Assistant Inspectors and Superintendents, 2nd Class, £450—£15—£550.
- 16 Chief Preventive Officers, Upper Section, £320—£15—£400.
- 26 Chief Preventive Officers, Lower Section, £240—£10—£300.
- 564 Preventive Officers, £115—£5—£150—£7 10s.—£200.
- 1,055 Preventive Men, 18s.—1s. 6d.—36s. plus six 1s. star allowances after 5, 9, 13, 17, 21 and 25 years' service.

3. *Work.*—The peace-time work, which the scales of pay of the grades of Preventive Officer and Preventive Man are intended to remunerate, is primarily preventive work for the purpose of watching and examining ships, crews and passengers from abroad in order to detect the smuggling of dutiable goods into the United Kingdom; and in this sense the Waterguard forms the first line of Revenue defence. There is also a certain amount of miscellaneous work, which is not Revenue work in any sense, but is required in the interests of other Government Departments who are concerned with seamen, ships and cargoes, and use the Customs Service as their agents because they have no appropriate staff of their own at the various ports. As regards the work generally, on the one hand (a) its subject matter is limited and it runs on fixed lines, though necessarily varying in type and value, (b) it includes a

very large amount of elementary and mechanical duties, (c) the procedure is not left to the individual Preventive Officer or Preventive Man, but is prescribed and defined in detailed regulations and instructions issued to him, (d) the Preventive Men act directly under the orders and constant supervision of the Preventive Officers and not alone or on their own initiative. At large ports the Preventive Officers and Preventive Men are directly under the supervision of the Chief Preventive Officers, and all three classes are under the Waterguard Superintendents, who exercise general control over both officers and men. At small ports where the work is not sufficient to occupy the whole time of a Chief Preventive Officer, a Surveyor of the Landing Department gives the necessary supervision as part of his ordinary duties.

4. *Work continued.*—On the other hand, the work requires strict integrity (there is perhaps no other service in which the lower ranks are more exposed to bribery, direct or indirect); strict sobriety (there are plenty of temptations to drink on shipboard); general firmness, tact and temper in dealing with passengers anxious to have their baggage cleared without delay or inconvenience on arrival in this country, and with seamen of all nationalities, who are inclined to resent interference with their personal belongings; and a special "flair" or sixth-sense in marking down smugglers, who are among the most artful of the law-breaking classes. Moreover, the duties are of a rough character, entailing considerable exposure; and though a superior officer can always be referred to if time permits, time and tide wait for no man, and an emergency may occasionally occur when a Preventive Officer has to take immediate action on his own responsibility.

5. *Night and Sunday Work.*—One of the main differences between the work of the Waterguard and that of the ordinary Civil Service lies in the Night and Sunday work. The ordinary Civil Servant's work is a daytime and week-day business, and any night-time or Sunday work is exceptional, casual, and in addition to his ordinary day's work. But the Waterguard's business is with shipping, which comes and goes indifferently at all hours of the day and night and on every day, week-days and Sundays alike, and which must be kept under observation even while at moorings in order to prevent illicit communication with the shore. The actual work required at night may be less, but the men must attend all the same. For this reason, at every seaport of any importance, the Waterguard day is divided into three 8-hour watches and the men keep watch in succession all round the clock, the night's attendance not being in addition to a day's attendance, but in substitution for it; and the same principle of exchange exists *mutatis mutandis* at the smaller ports. The inconveniences and disturbance arising from this regular night attendance are met by a special time allowance (*see par. 10*). As regards Sunday attendance, including Public Holidays, the work is reduced to the quick in order to let as many men off as possible, but the attendance cannot be treated as in substitution for ordinary week-day attendance (for at many ports to let every man attending on Sundays take a week-day holiday in lieu would involve maintaining a number of substitutes who would be idle for most of the week), and therefore the Sunday attendance is regarded as overtime attendance in addition to ordinary attendance, and is paid at overtime rates (*see par. 11*). It must also be noted that the value of the Overtime and Sunday pay granted to the Waterguard is very appreciably increased by the fact that it carries with it an exceptional right to pension (*see par. 13*).

6. *Special War Work.*—Owing to the war, the peace-time work has been extended to include keeping special supervision not only over the movements of ships and their passengers, crews and cargoes, but also over the loading and unloading of goods prohibited and restricted for blockade and other war purposes at the instance of the Admiralty, Home Office and other departments. This work includes novel duties above the average level of the men's ordinary duties, and requiring not only a knowledge of complicated instructions, but also at times a considerable amount of mental alertness and adaptability. (For the special remuneration given for this extra work, *see par. 14*.)

7. *Type of Man required.*—As regards preliminary training and education, experience shows that the type of entrant required is an able-bodied youth of the primary education standard. The entrance age is the 3 years 17 to 19, and appointments are normally confined to Boy Messengers in Government Departments, who have to leave on reaching the age of 18, when they are drawing about 13s. 6d. a week. The procedure is by limited competition in a simple examination held by the Civil Service Commissioners, followed by a strict medical test (*see Appendix B*). Pre-

ventive Officerships are filled by promotion from the senior Preventive Men by means of a qualifying examination in departmental subjects. At the last examination (June, 1918) the average service of the Preventive Men who attended was 17½ years. Chief Preventive Officerships are filled by the selection of Preventive Officers on the combined ground of seniority and merit.

8. *Salaries and Stars.*—The present salary scales, including the Preventive Men's Stars, have remained at the amounts fixed by the 1912 Committee, as shown in par. 2. The weekly equivalents of the yearly pay of the Preventive Officers and the yearly equivalents of the weekly pay of the Preventive Men are as follows:—

	Yearly.	Weekly.
Preventive Officers	£115—£5—£150— £7½—£200.	44s. 2d.—1s. 11d.—57s. 8d. —2s. 10d.—76s. 11d.
Preventive Men	£47—£3 18s.—£94— (plus £15½ Stars) £109½.	18s.—1s. 6d.—36s.— (plus 6s. Stars) 42s.

Stars, *i.e.*, good service allowances of 1s. a week apiece, were instituted in 1903, and their then number, 3, was increased to 6 in 1912; and it is to be noted that the earlier stars overlap increments, while the later continue to accrue after increments have ceased (*see* Appendix C). This system of good service allowances exists throughout the Navy, from the Good Conduct Badges given to petty officers and seamen to the Good Service Pensions given to Admirals and other Officers, and a complaint which the Federation has made that there is "a taint of charity" about them cannot be intended seriously. In addition to these fixed scales of pay, the men receive extra emoluments as follows.

9. *Overtime Pay.*—The scales of pay shown in paragraph 8 cover an attendance of 48 hours on the 6 week-days. Any attendance in excess of that amount is paid for as overtime at the rates shown in the 3rd column below:—

	Mean Salary per hour (48-hour Week).	Overtime per hour.
Preventive Officers:—	s. d.	s. d.
£151—£200	1 4¼	1 9
£115—£150	1 0¼	1 6
Preventive Men	7½	9

10. *Night-time Allowance.*—As shown in par. 5, a Preventive Officer or Preventive Man is liable to keep his watch either by day or night, the night watch being in substitution for, not in addition to, a day watch. The disturbance caused by night attendance (*i.e.*, attendance between 8 p.m. and 6 a.m.) is met by allowing every night hour to count one-sixth extra in reckoning the total week-day attendance. The effect is that, if two men attended 48 hours apiece during the 6 week-days, one entirely by night and the other entirely by day, the night man would get 8 hours' Overtime pay, but the day man would get none.

11. *Sunday and Public Holiday Pay.*—Attendance on Sundays and Public Holidays is all reckoned as Overtime (*see* par. 5), Night attendance being reckoned at one-sixth extra as on Week-days (*see* par. 10). A minimum of 3 hours' Overtime pay is allowed for Sunday attendance.

12. *Uniform.*—Preventive Officers and Preventive Men are supplied with full uniform free of cost, the present annual value, as compared with the pre-war value, being:—

	Pre-War.	Present.
Preventive Officers	£ s. d. 3 7 10	£ s. d. 5 0 3
Preventive Men	2 16 7	4 7 10

13. *Principal Peace-time Emoluments: Summary.*—Overtime and Sunday pay and Value of Uniform (pars. 9-12) represent the principal extra emoluments of the staff in peace-time. On the average they add to the salaries shown in par. 8 about £28 10s. a year in peace-time and £34 in war-time for each Preventive Officer, and almost £16 (say 6s. a week) in peace-time and £21 10s. (say 8s. a week) in war-time for each Preventive man (*see* Appendix D). The value of the Uniforms is also pensionable, which is usual; but what is very unusual is that, within certain maximum limits, the Overtime and Sunday pay is pensionable as well. This special privilege is due to the exceptional regularity of the work concerned (*see* par. 5), and it, of course, adds very considerably to the ultimate value of the emoluments. Besides these, there are other emoluments which are non-pensionable, some general but limited to the period of the war, others more of the nature of windfalls to individual men. They are as follows.

14. *War Work Allowances.*—These temporary allowances were instituted early in 1916 in view of the special war work thrown on the men (*see* par. 6). Their *raison d'être* was that even in peace-time the men's ordinary emoluments, though not inadequate, were in certain respects "tight," and that there was no margin that could be regarded as adequate pay for the new war work. The allowances, which are purely temporary, are as follows:—

Preventive Officers	£10 per annum.
Preventive Men	3s. a week.

15. *War Bonus.*—In common with other Civil Servants Preventive Officers and Preventive Men have been granted a temporary War Bonus to meet the increased cost of living, the present amounts being as follows:—

Preventive Officers		
Over £156 10s. per annum	£60 per annum.
Under £156 10s. per annum	23s. a week.
Preventive Men	23s. a week.

These amounts are regarded as wages for the purpose of calculating the rates of Overtime and Sunday pay, with the result that, in addition to the temporary War Bonus itself, a Preventive Officer gets about £9 and a Preventive Man about £11 a year temporary increase of remuneration for his Overtime and Sunday attendance.

16. *Temporary War-time emoluments: Summary.*—The two allowances shown in pars. 14-15 represent extra emoluments of the staff in war-time, in addition to the peace-time extra emoluments summarized in par. 13. They add about £80 a year (30s. a week) to the peace-time emoluments of Preventive Officers and Preventive Men (*see* Appendix D.). There remain three more or less anomalous windfalls, which are as follows.

17. *Aliens Work Allowances.*—Under an arrangement of some 12 years' standing, 19 Preventive Officers draw allowances ordinarily at the rate of £20 or £30 a year, and 20 Preventive Men draw allowances ordinarily at the rate of 2s. 8d. or 4s. a week, for doing Aliens work for the Home Office in the larger ports. These allowances have mostly been increased during the war. The men who draw them are interchangeable with the rest of the service, and only draw them while actually doing the work, and not while absent sick or on leave. They are therefore not a regular emolument common to the service as such, and they are only payable so long as the Home Office continues to desire the work to be done by the Customs rather than by a separate staff of its own.

18. *Seizure Rewards.*—The making of seizures in smuggling cases is part of the ordinary work of the staff (*see* par. 3), and the remuneration for doing it is covered by the Salaries and Allowances fixed for each rank (*see* pars. 8 and 13). But this particular branch of the work tends to become perfunctory, since negligence cannot easily be proved against indifferent workers. This is the *raison d'être* for Rewards. They are not remuneration for making the seizures, but extra incentives to alertness presented by the Board as a matter of grace and favour; the law and the departmental regulations alike make them entirely subject to the Board's discretion, and the system is periodically altered as occasion demands. As it is impossible to estimate the comparative merit of each different seizure, some rough and ready sliding scale is necessary. The last system, now discontinued, made the rewards vary according to the fine, if any, imposed on the smuggler. As the fines vary very greatly for a dozen accidental reasons, including the present rate of duty involved, this system worked out unfairly as between man and man and as between times of high duties and low duties, and it also offended the public sentiment against letting

seizing officers be pecuniarily interested in the amount of every penalty imposed. It has now been replaced by a flat-rate scale irrespective of fines (*e.g.*, 10s. 8d. for every pound of tobacco seized from a confessed or convicted smuggler), which will give the staff as a whole as much as they have been getting hitherto (about £1,400 a year for Preventive Officers and £1,700 for Preventive Men, on the average of the last six years), but will spread it more equably as between man and man, and will remain constant however much the duties rise or fall. This change will of course not affect either the Board's power of modifying the rewards as occasion demands, or the distinctive character of the rewards as discretionary presents, nor remuneration proper.

19. "*Acting*" Allowance.—Before 1912 provision was made for the absence of Preventive Officers by leave or sickness, partly by a small relief staff of Preventive Officers and partly by the "acting" system under which senior competent Preventive Men temporarily acted as Preventive Officers without extra remuneration. The amount of such "acting" was then about 12,000 days in the year. At the instance of the Committee of 1912 a special allowance of 1s. a day was given to Preventive Men when "acting," and the whole system was investigated, with the result that 25 new posts of Preventive Officer were created in order to reduce "acting" to a minimum. The present amount of "acting" is only about 3,500 days in the year, and the cost of the allowances is therefore under £200 a year. Speaking generally, the work is confined to competent seniors, and the allowances are consequently not an emolument common to the whole body of Preventive Men. The Federation contemplate making a claim for the payment of this acting Allowance at small places (*see par. 21*).

20. *Special London Allowance*.—The Federation also contemplate making a claim for an allowance for residence in London. A century ago, the Customs staff at each port was stationary and non-transferable; each port was self-contained and had its own scales of pay. This was mainly due to the difficulty of intercommunication between different towns, which made the cost of living, and therefore the scales of pay, very different at different places, and the cost of transferring Officers from one place to another very heavy. By degrees, as the facilities for intercommunication increased with the development of roads, railways, etc., the staffs became uniform and interchangeable, and the higher differential scales were narrowed down to certain classes at London and Liverpool; and the last remains of these had disappeared before the Waterguard staff was recreated in 1891. The present claim for a revival of the old differential system is based on the argument that the cost of living (including house-rent and travelling to and from work) still tends to be higher in large towns than in most (though by no means all) of the smaller places. This argument, of course, applies to all Civil Service classes, not merely to the Waterguard or the Customs service. On the other hand, large towns have counterbalancing advantages, especially as regards facilities for social intercourse and for educating and finding employment for children. The experience of the past proves that, if the staff is to remain fluid and interchangeable, a reversion to the old system of differential pay would only create a new set of grievances. When the rates were differential, the staff claimed to be levelled up to one uniform rate. Now that this has been done, they claim higher differential rates, and this see-saw will always continue. From the Service point of view, to revert to the old system, even in the case of the Waterguard only and London only, would destroy the fluidity of the staff and thereby seriously hamper administration.

21. *Former "In-Charge" Posts at Small Harbours*.—There are rather less than a hundred little harbours where the shipping trade is so insignificant from the Customs point of view that one man can do all the Waterguard work without even filling up his official day. Before the 1912 reorganisation they were manned in some cases by a Preventive Man (maximum wage 36s.), and in others by a Lower Section Preventive Officer (maximum salary £150), who were placed "in charge" not only of the Waterguard work proper, but also of any simple non-Waterguard work that might arise, and were given combined "in-charge" and overtime allowances (£15 to about 30 Preventive Men, and from £10 to £35 to about 60 Lower Section Preventive Officers). In 1912 the maximum pay of the 2 classes was raised to 42s. and £200 respectively, the "in-charge" payments were discontinued (vested interests being safeguarded), and the non-Waterguard work was transferred to the

7

Officer of the local Excise station. When he is not available, the Preventive Man or Preventive Officer is expected to assist, but the ultimate responsibility falls on him, not on them. The Federation contemplate making a claim for the restoration of the old allowances, but these small harbour billets are essentially "soft jobs," and therefore convenient backwaters for some of the elderly men who are no longer up to the ordinary work which the pay of their classes is intended to cover, and there is no reason for increasing their already increased scales of pay above those of their harder-worked brother-officers in the large ports. A further claim which the Federation contemplate making is for the payment of the Acting Allowance of 1s. a day (*see* par. 19) to Preventive Men at these small places, on the ground that they necessarily do any items of the Waterguard work which elsewhere would be done by a Preventive Officer. Such items, however, are so trifling, and the Waterguard work as a whole is so light, that it would be indefensible to pay these men allowances as if they were doing the full duties of Preventive Officers, whereas they are not even doing the full duties of Preventive Men.

22. "*On Call*" Posts.—At certain small ports where the work is too small to require a continuous watch, the men are liable to be occasionally called out to deal with a vessel arriving outside their spells of duty. They are not required to remain at home when off duty, awaiting possible calls, but merely to leave their address and be within reasonable reach if wanted; and, as a matter of fact, they usually know beforehand if a vessel is expected or not. When actually called out, they are credited with a minimum of 3 hours towards the aggregate weekly attendance as reckoned for Overtime purposes. Making every allowance for the trivial inconvenience thus caused them, their work generally and the conditions under which it is done are much easier than those of their brother-officers in the large ports, and there is no reason for increasing their pay either by the grant of special allowances, as now claimed by the Federation, or otherwise.

23. *Present Claims as to Overtime and Sunday Pay*.—The men make a series of claims, the principal two of which are that they should be allowed (A) overtime pay for attendance in excess of eight hours a day (instead of 48 hours a week as at present), and, in addition (B) extra pay (night pay) at the rate of half-an-hour's overtime pay for every hour between 6 p.m. and 6 a.m. (instead of the present extra time allowance of one-sixth of an hour for every hour between 8 p.m. and 6 a.m.). As regards claim (A), an eight-hour day is unsuited to the conditions of the Service. Waterguard work depends on the movements of shipping, and though at busy places these are sufficiently constant to justify regular eight-hour spells of attendance all round the clock (*see* para. 5), at other places they are spasmodic, and the men may have long and short spells in different periods of 24 hours. If the Crown were to pay overtime for the excess in the long spells, in equity the men should forfeit ordinary pay for the deficiency in the short spells. This would be cumbersome and would often work prejudicially to the men, and the practical course is to lump together all the days of the week, as is now done. A weekly basis of hours also obtains in the Post Office Service which is more analogous to the Waterguard than the industrial examples cited by the Federation. As regards claim (B), viz., that for extra pay for night attendance, no case can be made out for this on the analogy cited of the Customs and Excise Officers. These Officers are in the main a day-time Service, their night attendance, except in rare or accidental cases, being extra and additional to day attendance; whereas the Waterguard is necessarily a day and night Service, and night attendance is given in rotation with, and not as an addition to, day attendance. While, however, the Board cannot accept either of the two foregoing claims, they do not reject the whole of a third claim (C) made by the Federation, viz., that overtime pay should not be at flat rates as at present, but should be calculated on each man's hourly salary, and fixed at rate and a half for weekdays and double rate for Sundays and Public Holidays. This claim is one that might be considered when future permanent scales of salary are determined; but in the present unsettled conditions, and as, moreover, the temporary war bonus now reckons for overtime at a flat rate of 6d. an hour, it would be inconvenient to recast the whole basis of rates as proposed. Concessions, however, might be conveniently made in regard to rates as suggested in paras. 26 and 27 below, leaving the other points of the men's present claim, including minor points of detail not touched upon in this counter-statement, to be considered in a general review of the overtime arrangements when the future permanent scales are under consideration.

24. *Review of the 1912 Reorganisation.*—Putting aside any special adjustments required by the present temporary war-time conditions, the question remains whether the six years' experience that has been gained of the working of the 1912 scheme would have justified any modifications, supposing that there had been no war. For purposes of comparison with other classes, whether inside or outside the Civil Service, it is necessary to look at the pay, prospects of promotion, and general conditions of service as a whole, and from the point of view of the *whole* it does not appear that the Waterguard's pre-war remuneration, including the extra emoluments, was inadequate. As shown in para. 13, it ranged in peace-time on the average from £143 to £228 a year for Preventive Officers, and from 24s. to 48s. a week for Preventive Men, and as a matter of fact it attracted more than a sufficient supply of properly qualified new entrants. At the same time the experience of those six years shows that, as stated in para. 14, there was not such a surplus "margin" as would justify any very appreciable addition to the higher work, and that there remain certain points of friction where there is a *prima facie* claim for some permanent improvement, as follows.

25. *Salary Improvement.*—The scales shown in para. 8 seem to press tightly in five places, viz. :—

- (a) The initial salary of Preventive Men for the first two years, viz., 18s. and 19s. 6d. It is true that this is only the apprenticeship stage of their career, but the lad's parents are often not in a position to help them during that stage, and for this reason the salary might have been put at 20s. a week for the first two years.
- (b) The Preventive Men's increment.—The increment of 1s. 6d. a week (roughly £4 a year) is not disproportionate to a scale starting as low as 18s., and can be paralleled from various other Outdoor Establishments; but as the scale is a fairly long one (more than doubling itself) the increment might have been put at 2s. (roughly £5 a year).
- (c) The Preventive Men's Stars (*see* para. 8).—The above increase of the increment would do away with the main reason for granting stars while increments are still accruing, but not with the reason for granting others after the increments have stopped. For simplicity's sake there is much to be said for absorbing four out of the existing stars into increments (thereby making the new salary scale 20s.—2s.—40s.), and adding the remaining two stars at intervals of four years apiece after the 40s. has been reached.
- (d) The Preventive Officer's Initial Salary.—This is at present only £5 10s. above the Preventive Man's maximum wage. It is true that, in addition, the average extra remuneration earned by the Preventive Officer is higher than that earned by the Preventive Man (*see* Appendix D), but the promotion from a non-responsible to a responsible class is a matter which ought to be clearly marked in the salary scale, and the Preventive Officer's initial salary might have been put at £120 instead of £115.
- (e) The Increment of Preventive Officers below £150.—If the Preventive Men's increment is raised to £5, that of the junior Preventive Officers should be correspondingly raised from £5 to £7 10s., so as to make it identical with that of the seniors, the Efficiency Bar being left at £150, as at present.

A comparison of the existing and the proposed scales is shown in Appendix C. The total cost of the five changes indicated would rise rapidly from about £600 in the first year to about £10,000 in the fifteenth.

26. *Preventive Men's Overtime Pay: Improvement.*—As shown in para. 9, the present overtime rate for Preventive Men is 9d. per hour, while their present mean salary rate (scale 18s. to 42s.) is 7½d. per hour. In view of the length of the salary scale, the 9d. rate seems disproportionately high for the junior men and low for the seniors. If the salary scale proposed in para. 25 is adopted, the comparison of the salary rate with the Overtime rate will be as shown in Appendix E, and it is suggested that for the present, and pending a general review of the whole question of Overtime (*see* para. 23), the Overtime rate should be fixed "without prejudice"

at 8*d.* per hour for men at 30*s.* and under, and 1*s.* an hour for men over 30*s.*, with the reservation that no man's existing rate shall be reduced. The cost would be £1,780 a year.

27. *Sunday Pay, Improvement.*—By Award No. 53 of the Conciliation and Arbitration Board, dated 22nd July, 1918, the Sunday and Public Holiday pay of Customs Watchers was increased from the single Overtime rate to Overtime and a half. It is suggested that the same concession should be granted to the Water-guard, who at present only get the single Overtime rate (*see* par. 11). If the Overtime rate of Preventive Men were left at 9*d.* as at present, the concession would cost approximately £9,000 a year, but if it were altered to 8*d.* and 1*s.*, as proposed in par. 26, the cost would be increased to £10,400 a year.

28. *Improvements, Summary.*—If the proposals contained in pars. 25-27 are adopted, the new salary scales would be as follows:—

Preventive Officers	£120—7½—200.
Preventive Men	20 <i>s.</i> —2 <i>s.</i> —40 <i>s.</i> , plus two 1 <i>s.</i> star allowances after 15 and 19 years' service.

The Overtime pay for Preventive Men would be 8*d.* per hour for wages not exceeding 30*s.* and 1*s.* for those above, and the Sunday and Public Holiday pay for Preventive Officers and Preventive Men would be Overtime and a half. The total extra cost would be £12,500 in the first year, rising gradually to £22,000 a year, made up as follows:—

	Preventive Officers.	Preventive Men.
	£	£
Salaries	6,000	4,000
Overtime Pay	—	1,780
Sunday Pay	5,540	4,860
Total	£11,540	£10,640

The consequent increase in the average total emoluments of the individual men is shown in Appendix D. Speaking roughly, the average peace-time extras shown in par. 13 would be increased from £28 10*s.* to £36 10*s.* for Preventive Officers, and from £16 (6*s.* a week) to about £23 (8*s.* 9*d.* a week) for Preventive Men.

29. *Effect on War-work Allowances.*—The series of caveats issued by various Parliamentary Committees against permanently increasing departmental pay during the war obliged the Department to throw its original proposals for war-work allowances (*see* par. 14) into the form of a temporary grant. The argument used to justify that grant was that the permanent rates of pay did not provide sufficient margin to cover the work of novel character imposed on the staff in war-time; but if the permanent rates are now improved as suggested, it will raise the question whether the War-work allowances ought not to be diminished or discontinued. On the other hand, the men have done this special work both loyally and well, and have saved the time and trouble that would otherwise have been spent in training sailors or soldiers to do it; furthermore, as compared with the temporary war-workers employed by the various new Ministries, their pay is not overlarge, even after allowing for the fact that it is permanent and pensionable; the flow of promotion from Preventive Man to Preventive Officer has been retarded by causes directly due to the war, and it is a question whether these special allowances should not be continued so long as the men are doing this special work and their pay is not increased beyond what is now proposed, it being of course understood that when the work ceases the allowances will cease with it.

30. *Conclusion.*—It is no more possible now to forecast what future peace-time conditions will be than it was possible before the war to forecast what future war-time conditions would be. The Board of Customs and Excise have therefore confined themselves to the question whether any case for improvement could have been made out, supposing there had been no war. From this point of view they cannot admit that cause has been shown under any of the items mentioned except three, *viz.*, firstly, the Salary (or Wage) scales of both classes (Preventive Officers

and Preventive Men); secondly, the rate of Overtime pay for Preventive Men; and thirdly, the Sunday pay for both classes. As regards these three items they think that the Salary scales, though not inadequate, are "tight" at various points (par. 25), and that there is something to be said for increasing the Preventive Men's Overtime rate for the seniors and decreasing it for the juniors, as a temporary measure pending the ultimate review of the whole overtime conditions when the future permanent scales of salary are under consideration (par. 26). The Sunday pay is consequential on the Watcher Award (par. 27). The immediate cost of the three measures, taken together, would ultimately approximate to £22,000 a year but in the first year would be round about £12,500 (see par. 28). The benefit so given would raise the question of continuing the existing War Work allowances (see par. 14), but there is something to be said for retaining them while the special Wartime work remains (see par. 29).

Custom House, E.C.,
21 Jan., 1919,

The Overtime pay for Preventive Men would be 5d. per hour for wages not exceeding 50s. and 1s. for those above and the Sunday and Public Holiday pay for Preventive Men would be 2s. 6d. per week. The total extra cost would be £12,500 in the first year rising gradually to £22,000 a year.

Category	1919-20	1920-21	1921-22	1922-23	1923-24
Wages	£12,500	£15,000	£17,500	£20,000	£22,000
Public Holiday	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000
Sunday	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000	£1,000
Total	£14,500	£17,000	£19,500	£22,000	£24,000

The Government propose in the new Bill to increase the wages of the Preventive Men... The Bill will be introduced in the House of Commons in the near future... The Government are anxious to secure the best possible conditions for the men who are engaged in the most important work of the country... The Bill will be introduced in the House of Commons in the near future... The Government are anxious to secure the best possible conditions for the men who are engaged in the most important work of the country... The Bill will be introduced in the House of Commons in the near future... The Government are anxious to secure the best possible conditions for the men who are engaged in the most important work of the country...

WATERGUARD STAFF.—INCREASES IN SALARIES AND PROMOTIONS.

1892.	1911.	1912.	1918.
On formation after the Goschen re-organisation of 1891.	Prior to re-organisation under the Report of the Waterguard Committee of 1912.	After re-organisation under the Report of the Waterguard Committee of 1912.	Present Authorised Staff.
1 Inspector £600-20-650	1 Inspector ... £600-20-650	1 Inspector General £850-25-1,000 3 Inspectors and Waterguard Superintendents, 1st Class. £600-20-650	1 Inspector General £850-25-1,000 3 Inspectors and Waterguard Superintendents, 1st Class. £600-20-650
1 Assistant Inspector ... £560-15-590	2 Assistant Inspectors. £450-15-550	9 Assistant Inspectors and Waterguard Superintendents, 2nd Class. £450-15-550	9 Assistant Inspectors and Waterguard Superintendents, 2nd Class. £450-15-550
6 Preventive Surveyors ... £350-15-420	22 Chief Preventive Officers. £240-10-300-15-400	16 Chief Preventive Officers, Upper Section. £320-15-400	16 Chief Preventive Officers, Upper Section. £320-15-400
12 Chief Preventive Officers £230-10-340	25 Superintendents £160-10-200 100 Preventive Officers, Upper Section. £160-7½-200	26 Chief Preventive Officers, Lower Section. £240-10-300	26 Chief Preventive Officers, Lower Section. £240-10-300
310 Preventive Officers ... £90-5-150	411* Preventive Officers, Lower Section. £95-5-150	521* Preventive Officers. £115-5-150-7½-200	564 Preventive Officers. £115-5-150-7½-200
1,126 Boatmen £55-1-80	1032† Preventive Men. 18s.-1s. 6d.-33s., plus three 1s. Star allowances.	1,005† Preventive Men. 18s.-1s. 6d.-36s., plus six 1s. star allowances.	1055 Preventive Men. 18s.-1s. 6d.-36s. plus six 1s. Star allowances.

* 61 with allowances varying from £10 to £35 as Officers in charge of ports, etc.; 22 with allowances of £15 as Second Officers.

† 32 with allowances of £15 as Preventive Men in charge of sub-ports, etc.; 25 with allowances of £5 or £10 as Second Officers.